

13 REPORTS OF INFRASTRUCTURE SERVICES

IS175	WHITEHILL ROAD REALIGNMENT SURVEY REPORT
-------	--

AGENDA REFERENCE:	D-18-054000
AUTHOR:	M Dufour, Acting Manager Engineering Services
EXECUTIVE:	C Lee, Director Infrastructure Services
DATE OF REPORT:	4 July 2018
FILE REFERENCE:	EM/10/0006
ATTACHMENTS:	Yes (x1) Whitehill Road Realignment Survey Report – May 2018

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

The City has recently completed a further significant community engagement project with respect to Whitehill Road connectivity. The purpose of this report is to provide Council with a copy of the resulting community engagement report and seek a Council resolution on the preferred option to enable planning and design works to proceed.

EXECUTIVE RECOMMENDATION:

That Council by Simple Majority pursuant to Section 5.20 of the Local Government Act 1995 RESOLVES to:

1. RECEIVE the Whitehill Road Realignment Survey Report;
2. ENDORSE Option three (3) as a coastal adaptation measure for the Whitehill Road foreshore (Connect to Drummond Cove Road via Estuary Way and extend across the back of the foreshore reserve); and
3. AUTHORISE the CEO to undertake the planning, survey, detailed design and estimation works associated with the preferred connectivity option utilising the CHRMAP Adaptation Measures fund endorsed by Council as part of 2018-19 budget.

PROPONENT:

The proponent is the City of Greater Geraldton.

BACKGROUND:

In early 2016, high tides and strong swells eroded Whitehill Road forcing its closure between the John Batten Community Hall and Drummond Cove Road. In response, a number of community engagement activities have been undertaken with details provided to Councillors.

The *Whitehill Road Realignment Survey* (refer to Attachment No. IS175) was undertaken in May 2018. The survey was distributed to all households and landowners located on the west side of Chapman Road within the locality of Drummond Cove and Glenfield Beach Estate. It provided the community with five (5) connectivity options. The survey was undertaken to determine whether or not the local community wanted to re-establish a road connection between John Batten Community Hall and Drummond Cove Road, and if so,

on what alignment. The five options presented to the community along with high-level cost estimates are shown below:

Possible North-South Routes

Option 1
 Connect to Estuary Way and build a new road on lots #240 & #246
 Estimated cost: \$370,000



Option 2
 Connect to Estuary Way and Boat Cove
 Estimated cost: \$200,000



Option 3
 Connect to Estuary Way and extend across the coastal reserve
 Estimated cost: \$420,000



Possible North-South Routes continued

Option 4
 Connect to Estuary Way to access Whitehill Road
 Estimated cost: \$680,000
 *This option requires coastal protection.



Option 5
 Connect to Estuary Way provide no access to Whitehill Road
 Estimated Cost: \$50,000



Connectivity options presented to the community

With reference to the attached survey report, connectivity is desired by 78% of the survey respondents with option three (3) being the preferred alignment.

Connectivity options report results

Option 1	Connect to Drummond Cove Road via Estuary Way and a road through lots #240 and #246	2%
Option 2	Connect to Drummond Cove Road via Estuary Way and Boat Cove	22%
Option 3	Connect to Drummond Cove Road via Estuary Way and extend across the back of the foreshore reserve	40%
Option 4	Connect to Drummond Cove Road via Estuary Way and Whitehill Road	18%
Option 5	Connect to Drummond Cove Road via Estuary Way and provide no connection to Whitehill Road	10%
Other	I want the road reconnected, but I don't like any of these options	8%

Option 3

Connect to Estuary Way and extend across the coastal reserve
 Estimated cost: \$420,000



Survey preferred connectivity option

Agreement in principal has been reached with the owners of Lot 9010 (Estuary Way) regarding the establishment of a road reserve and construction thereto to facilitate the joining of the two sections of Estuary Way (southern

end). This would be required as part of any development of the lot. A road reserve would also need to be created at the rear of the City's foreshore reserve (Reserve R44791) at the northern end.

COMMUNITY, ENVIRONMENT, ECONOMY AND GOVERNANCE ISSUES:

Community:

The survey suggests that there will be a positive community impact through the restoration of connectivity at Drummond Cove. Some residences will be impacted by the community's preferred realignment option due to their proximity.

Environment:

The preferred connectivity option realigns the road behind the 2030 erosion setback line. It addresses the erosion impact to the road asset at Whitehill Road in line with the Draft Planned or Managed Retreat Guidelines developed by the Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage.

Economy:

Finalising the issues along the Drummond Cove Foreshore are expected to have a positive impact on the local economy.

Governance:

The preferred connectivity is consistent with:

- State Planning Policy 2.6 (State Coastal Planning Policy);
- Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage Draft *Planned or Managed Retreat Guidelines*; and
- City of Greater Geraldton Local Planning Strategy.

RELEVANT PRECEDENTS:

At the Ordinary Meeting of Council of 26 September 2017, Item DCS343, Council determined to invite Point Moore lessees to surrender their current leases and enter into new 21 years leases. In line with the Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage Draft *Planned or Managed Retreat Guidelines*, the new lease included trigger points to manage the retreat from coastal hazards. When one or more trigger points with respect to sea level rise, erosion, public health, power supply, wastewater and water supply are realised the leases will be mandatorily terminated.

In July 2017, in line with the Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage Draft *Planned or Managed Retreat Guidelines* the City removed a toilet block from Triton Place as the coastal erosion hazard had encroached within a few metres of the building.

COMMUNITY/COUNCILLOR CONSULTATION:

Since May 2016, the City has been conducting ongoing community engagement with the Drummond Cove community regarding erosion along the Whitehill Road foreshore.

Engagement timeline:

May 2016: Whitehill Road Community Workshop - which 73 people attended. The workshop gave participants the opportunity to be involved in two objectives:

Objective 1: To gain a better understanding the importance of Whitehill Road (since it had already been partially closed due to coastal erosion) and in particular the connection it provided between John Batten Community Hall and Drummond Cove Road. More than 85% of participants stated the road either meant: something, a lot, or the world to them.

Objective 2: To determine the community's preferred temporary coastal adaptation measure for the area to be implemented by the City whilst waiting for the results of the coastal adaptation project. More than 60% of participants stated sand nourishment was their preferred temporary solution.

Media Releases

- July 2016: Media Release - Emergency sand nourishment to slow Drummond Cove coastal erosion;
- April 2017: Media Release - Sand nourishment works on Whitehill Road;
- June 2017: Community Service Announcement - Whitehill Road fencing upgrade;
- October 2017: Media Release - Drummond Cove fence vandals urged to stop antisocial behaviour;
- 9 May 2018: Media Release - Whitehill Road survey underway; and
- 22 May 2018: Media Release - Sand nourishment critical to reducing erosion.

Survey

May 2018: Whitehill Road Realignment Community Survey (refer to Attachment No. IS175). A total of 372 responses were received.

Objective 1: To determine whether or not the local community wanted to re-establish a road connection between John Batten Community Hall and Drummond Cove Road. 78% were in favour of re-establishing road access. This outcome is consistent with the results from the Whitehill Road Community Workshop where 85% stated the Whitehill Road either meant something, a lot, or the world to them

Objective 2: Should connectivity be desired, what the community's preferred option would be. 40% chose Option 3 as their preferred option.

In addition to the five (5) options provided in the survey, respondents provided eight (8) alternate connectivity options:

- One (1) suggestion is a variation of the *Do Nothing* approach considered by City Officers. It is not recommended for the same reason identified in the *Do Nothing* approach.

- Three (3) suggestions are variations of the *Construction of coastal protection* option considered by City Officers. These are not recommended for the same reason(s) as identified in the *Construction of coastal protection* approach;
- Three (3) suggestions provide partial connectivity. These are not recommended as they do not address community's desire for connectivity between John Batten Hall and Drummond Cove Road.
- One (1) suggestion proposed connectivity between Bayside Boulevard and Drummond Cove Road on Council owned/vested land. This is not recommended as it does not address community's desire for connectivity between John Batten Hall and Drummond Cove Road.

LEGISLATIVE/POLICY IMPLICATIONS:

The proposal is consistent with the State Planning Policy 2.6 (State Coastal Planning Policy). The proposal is consistent with the Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage (DPLH) Draft Planned or Managed Retreat Guidelines. The proposal is consistent with the City of Greater Geraldton's Local Planning Strategy.

FINANCIAL AND RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS:

The Council has provided \$600,000 for adaptation measures as part of the 2018-19 capital renewal budget. The recommended planning and design works for this project are expected to be between \$50,000 and \$70,000.

INTEGRATED PLANNING LINKS:

Title: Environment	2.2 Sustainability
Strategy 2.2.3	Promoting and planning innovative design that enables low impact living and sustainable urban development.
Title: Environment	2.3 Built Environment
Strategy 2.3.1	Promoting a built environment that is well planned and meets the current and future needs of the community.
Strategy 2.3.3	Providing a fit for purpose, safe and efficient infrastructure network.
Title: Environment	2.4 Asset Management
Strategy 2.4.1	Applying financial sustainability principles to ensure a coordinated and integrated approach to infrastructure planning, implementation, maintenance and renewal.
Title: Governance	4.1 Community Engagement
Strategy 4.1.1	Continuing to engage broadly and proactively with the community.

REGIONAL OUTCOMES:

There are no regional outcomes.

RISK MANAGEMENT:

The executive recommendation addresses the identified risk of Whitehill Road being inside the storm-bite trigger point line, thus requiring a managed retreat adaptation measure. The recommended measures are based on the best

available science and information regarding coastal processes and the need for adequate coastal setbacks. This is in line with the City of Greater Geraldton Local Planning Strategy.

In addition, the recommended measures are in line with the Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage Draft *Planned or Managed Retreat Guidelines*.

There will also be some residual reputation risk, due to varying respondent survey connectivity preference. However, the recommendation aligns with the 78% of respondents that want to re-establish connectivity.

ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS CONSIDERED BY CITY OFFICERS:

The following options were considered by City Officers:

Decommission or leave the Whitehill road closed:

This is not recommended since it does not address community's desire for connectivity between John Batten Hall and Drummond Cove Road.

Reconstruct Whitehill Road on former alignment:

Coastal protection works would cost between \$2M to \$3M, in addition to the costs to reconstruct the road. This option is not recommended as it is financially costly compared to the preferred connectivity option. The ongoing maintenance and repair costs would also be higher than the community's preferred connectivity option.

Cr Douglas moved an alternative motion to defer determination of connectivity option until the CHRMAP process is complete.

COUNCIL DECISION

MOVED CR DOUGLAS, SECONDED CR MCILWAINE

That Council by Simple Majority pursuant to Section 5.20 of the Local Government Act 1995 RESOLVES to:

- 1. RECEIVE the Whitehill Road Realignment Survey Report; and**
- 2. DEFER determination of a connectivity option until the CHRMAP process is complete and the outcomes of coastal protection works (including the proposed geo—textile groynes) are clear.**

CARRIED 11/1

Time: 6:51 PM

Not Voted: 3

No Votes: 1

Yes Votes: 11

Name	Vote
Cr. Douglas	YES
Cr. Bylund	YES
Cr. Caudwell	YES
Cr. Colliver	YES
Cr. Clune	YES
Cr. Critch	YES

Cr. Freer	NOT PRESENT
Cr. Elphick	YES
Cr. Hall	YES
Cr. Keemink	NOT PRESENT
Cr. McIlwaine	YES
Cr. Reymond	YES
Cr. Tanti	NOT PRESENT
Cr. Thomas	YES
Mayor Van Styn	NO

REASON FOR VARIATION TO THE EXECUTIVE RECOMMENDATION –
Cr Douglas’ stated he thinks the original motion was too risky from an
environmental; social and financial point of view.